Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence

Subseries of Lecture Notes in Computer Science

Edited by J. Siekmann

BIBLIOTHEQUE DU CERIST

Lecture Notes in Computer Science

Edited by G. Goos and J. Hartmanis

BIBLIOTHEQUE DU CERIST

Editorial

Artificial Intelligence has become a major discipline under the roof of Computer Science. This is also reflected by a growing number of titles devoted to this fast developing field to be published in our Lecture Notes in Computer Science. To make these volumes immediately visible we have decided to distinguish them by a special cover as Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence, constituting a subseries of the Lecture Notes in Computer Science. This subseries is edited by an Editorial Board of experts from all areas of AI, chaired by Jörg Siekmann, who are looking forward to consider further AI monographs and proceedings of high scientific quality for publication.

We hope that the constitution of this subseries will be well accepted by the audience of the Lecture Notes in Computer Science, and we feel confident that the subseries will be recognized as an outstanding opportunity for publication by authors and editors of the AI community.

Editors and publisher

CC-01-4-12

Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence

Edited by J. Siekmann

Subseries of Lecture Notes in Computer Science

BIBLIOTHEQUE DU CERIST

422

Bernhard Nebel

Reasoning and Revision in Hybrid Representation Systems

Springer-Verlag
Berlin Heidelberg New York London Paris Tokyo Hong Kong

Author
Bernhard Nebel
Deutsches Forschungszentrum für Künstliche Intelligenz (DFKI)
Stuhlsatzenhausweg 3, D-6600 Saarbrücken 11, FRG

BIBLIOTHEQUE DU CERIST

5446

CR Subject Classification (1987): I.2.3–4

ISBN 3-540-52443-6 Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg New York
ISBN 0-387-52443-6 Springer-Verlag New York Berlin Heidelberg

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, re-use of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in other ways, and storage in data banks. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is only permitted under the provisions of the German Copyright Law of September 9, 1965, in its version of June 24, 1985, and a copyright fee must always be paid. Violations fall under the prosecution act of the German Copyright Law.

© Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 1990
Printed in Germany

Printing and binding: Druckhaus Beltz, Hemsbach/Bergstr.
2145/3140-543210 – Printed on acid-free paper

Preface

The dynamic aspects of knowledge representation systems, namely, *reasoning* with represented knowledge and *revising* represented knowledge, are the most important aspects of such systems. In this book, these aspects are investigated in the context of hybrid representation systems based on KL-ONE.

After a general introduction to knowledge representation, reasoning, and revision, a typical member of the family of hybrid representation systems based on KL-ONE is introduced and analyzed from a semantic and algorithmic point of view. This analysis leads to new complexity results about subsumption determination and a characterization of a proposed hybrid inference algorithm as conditionally complete. Additionally, it is shown that so-called terminological cycles can be integrated smoothly into the framework.

Based on the analysis of representation and reasoning in KL-ONE-based systems, the revision problem is investigated. A survey of some approaches to belief revision leads to a reconstruction of symbol-level belief revision on the knowledge level. A conceptual analysis of terminological revision demonstrates that belief revision techniques developed for the revision of assertional knowledge are not adequate for the revision of terminological knowledge. For this reason, a literal revision approach is adopted. Essentially, it amounts to minimal mutilations in the literal description of definitions. Finally, implementation techniques for terminological revision operations are described, and the interface problem for a knowledge acquisition system is discussed.

This book is a revised version of my doctoral dissertation, accepted by the University of Saarland in June 1989. Most of the work was carried out while I was a member of the KIT-BACK project at the Technical University of Berlin. The final version was written up while I participated in the LILOG project as a guest researcher at the Scientific Center IBM Germany, Institute for Knowledge-Based Systems, Stuttgart.

I am indebted to my thesis advisor Wolfgang Wahlster, who stimulated my interest in knowledge representation in the first place while I was a member of the HAM-ANS project and who encouraged me in the following years to carry out the research described here.

Additionally, I would like to express my thanks to all those people without whom this book would not be what it is now. Foremost, there are my colleagues in the KIT group at the Technical University of Berlin and in the LILOG project at the Scientific Center of IBM Germany, Stuttgart. In particular, working with Kai von Luck, Christof Peltason, and Albrecht Schmiedel in the KIT-BACK project was a pleasure and played a central role in starting the research described here.

BIBLIOTHEQUE DU CERIST

Once started, Kai played a driving force by always asking for the next chapter.

Furthermore, I would like to thank Peter Gärdenfors for making available the manuscript of his book and for his comments on some points concerning base revision; Otthein Herzog and Claus Rollinger for inviting me to participate in the LILOG project; Bob MacGregor for a number of discussions and suggestions, including the hint that realization must be easier than subsumption; Bernd Mahr for comments on the semantics of cycles; Peter Patel-Schneider for making the KANDOR system available and for discussions on semantics and complexity; Klaus Schild for showing me that subsumption in general terminological languages is undecidable; Jim Schmolze for pointing out that cycles are a serious problem; Jörg Siekmann, who was the second reader of the thesis, for asking the right questions and giving some valuable hints; Gert Smolka for numerous helpful discussions on semantic specification, algorithms, and the relationship between feature logic and KL-ONE; Norm Sondheimer for inviting me to ISI as a guest researcher and for showing me how to use KL-TWO in a natural language system; Jay Tucker for proof-reading various versions of the thesis (I take credit for any remaining flaws, of course); Marc Vilain for discussions on realization algorithms; and a number of other people too many to be listed here.

BIBLIOTHEQUE DU CERIST

Contents

BIBLIOTHEQUE DU CERIST

I Representation, Reasoning and Revision – The Idea

1 Introduction 3
- 1.1 A Dynamic View of Knowledge Bases 3
- 1.2 Hybrid Systems Based on KL-ONE 4
- 1.3 An Introductory Example 5
- 1.4 Outline 8

2 Representation and Management of Knowledge 11
- 2.1 Knowledge and its Representation 11
  - 2.1.1 Knowledge and Data 12
  - 2.1.2 The Knowledge Level 13
  - 2.1.3 The Knowledge Representation Hypothesis 15
  - 2.1.4 Three Approaches to Knowledge Representation 16
- 2.2 Knowledge Representation Formalisms 18
  - 2.2.1 Semantics of Representation Formalisms 18
  - 2.2.2 Adequacy Criteria 20
  - 2.2.3 Hybrid Formalisms 21
  - 2.2.4 Formalizing a Body of Knowledge 22
- 2.3 Knowledge Representation Systems 23
  - 2.3.1 The Architecture of Knowledge-Based Systems 23
  - 2.3.2 Services of Knowledge Representation Systems 25
  - 2.3.3 Inferential Services 26
  - 2.3.4 Revision Services 28
- 2.4 Knowledge Base Management Systems 30

II Hybrid Representation and Reasoning

3 A Hybrid Representation Formalism 37
- 3.1 Object-Centered Representation 37
  - 3.1.1 Semantic Networks 38
  - 3.1.2 Frame Systems 39
  - 3.1.3 Structural Inheritance Networks 41
  - 3.1.4 Terminological Knowledge Representation 44
- 3.2 The Terminological Formalism $\mathcal{TF}$ 46

3.2.1 The Syntax of the Terminological Formalism 47
3.2.2 The Semantics of the Terminological Formalism 50
3.2.3 Relationships in Terminologies 52
3.2.4 Normal-Form Terminologies and Constructive Semantics . 54
3.2.5 Abstracting from Term Introductions 60
3.2.6 The Significance of Term Introductions 61
3.3 The Assertional Formalism $\mathcal{AF}$ 63
3.3.1 Syntax and Semantics of $\mathcal{AF}$ 65
3.3.2 Hybrid Entailment and Subsumption 67
3.4 Possible Extensions of the Formalisms 68
3.4.1 Extending the Terminological Formalism 69
3.4.2 Attributive Descriptions 70
3.4.3 Extending the Assertional Formalism 71

4 Reasoning in the Formalism 73
4.1 Computing Term-Subsumption 74
4.1.1 An Algorithm for Subsumption Detection 74
4.1.2 Properties of the Algorithm 78
4.2 Analysis of the Term-Subsumption Problem 81
4.2.1 Decidability of Subsumption in $\mathcal{NTF}_T$ 81
4.2.2 Computational Complexity of Subsumption in $\mathcal{NTF}_T$ . . . 87
4.2.3 Living with an Incomplete Reasoner 90
4.3 Subsumption in Terminologies Revisited 92
4.3.1 The Complexity of the Reduction to Term-Subsumption . 92
4.3.2 Complexity of Subsumption in Terminologies 93
4.3.3 Efficiency of Subsumption in Practice 97
4.4 Classification 98
4.4.1 Assert-Time versus Query-Time Inferences 98
4.4.2 A Classification Algorithm 99
4.4.3 Worst Cases in Classification 101
4.5 Hybrid Inferences 102
4.5.1 Testing Instance Relationships 102
4.5.2 Realization = Propagation + Abstraction + Classification 104
4.5.3 Model-Based Terminological Reasoning 109
4.5.4 Model-Based Reasoning as the Limiting Case of Realization 113
4.6 Evaluation of the Inference Capabilities 117

5 Terminological Cycles 119
5.1 The Intuitions Behind Terminological Cycles 120
5.1.1 Recursively Defined Finite Object Structures 120
5.1.2 Infinite Object Structures 121
5.1.3 Circular Object Structures 123
5.1.4 Primitiveness and Instance Recognition 124
5.2 Semantics of Terminological Cycles 125
5.2.1 Lattices and Fixed Points 126
5.2.2 Fixed Point Semantics 127

BIBLIOTHEQUE DU CERIST

5.2.3 Descriptive Semantics 133
5.2.4 Evaluating the Semantics 134
5.3 Consequences of the Descriptive Semantics 136
5.3.1 Circular Roles 136
5.3.2 Component-Circular Concepts 137
5.3.3 Restriction-Circular Concepts 139
5.3.4 Semantic and Syntactic Cycles 140
5.3.5 Finite, Cyclic Semantic Structures 142
5.4 Reasoning with Terminological Cycles 146

III Revision

6 Belief Revision 151
6.1 Problems in Belief Revision 151
6.2 The Logic of Theory Change 153
6.2.1 Expansion, Contraction, and Revision 154
6.2.2 Full Meet Contraction 156
6.2.3 Maxichoice Contraction 157
6.2.4 Partial Meet Contraction 158
6.3 Changes of Finite Theory Bases 159
6.3.1 Logical Data Bases and Diagnosis 160
6.3.2 Base Contraction is a Partial Meet Contraction 161
6.3.3 Epistemic Relevance and Reason Maintenance 163
6.3.4 Representational and Computational Issues 166
6.4 Model-Theoretic Updates 167
6.4.1 Minimal Pertubation of Models 168
6.4.2 Nonminimal Model-Theoretic Updates 170
6.5 Nonmonotonic Reasoning 171
6.5.1 Circumscription 172
6.5.2 Default Theories 173
6.5.3 Default Theories, the Logic of Theory Change, and the Knowledge Base Revision Problem 174
6.6 Reason-Maintenance Techniques 175
6.6.1 Monotonic Data-Dependency Networks 176
6.6.2 Nonmonotonic Data-Dependency Networks 180
6.6.3 Justification-Based Reason Maintenance 183
6.6.4 Assumption-Based Reason Maintenance 185
6.6.5 Utilizing Reason-Maintenance Techniques in Knowledge Base Revision 186

7 The Revision Problem in Terminological Systems 187
7.1 Terminologies in Flux 187
7.1.1 Terminologies, Analytic Knowledge, and Revisions 188
7.1.2 General Principles for Knowledge Base Revision 189
7.1.3 Problems in Revising a Terminology 191

BIBLIOTHEQUE DU CERIST

7.2 Previous Solutions 191
7.2.1 Network Editing Approaches 192
7.2.2 Knowledge Base Editing 193
7.2.3 Adding and Deleting Definitions 195
7.2.4 Modifications Viewed as Additions 199
7.2.5 A Functional, Knowledge-Level Approach 200
7.3 A Framework for Terminological Revision 202
7.3.1 Terminological Revision Viewed as Belief Revision 202
7.3.2 Terminological Revision as Revision of Literal Definitions . 204
7.3.3 Properties of the Literal Revision Approach 207
7.4 Revision in Hybrid Representation Systems 210

8 Terminological Reason Maintenance 213
8.1 Incremental Classification 213
8.1.1 What Kind of Reason Maintenance Do We Need? 214
8.1.2 Recording and Justifying Terminological Inferences 215
8.1.3 Redundancy and Functional Equivalence 217
8.2 Invariants of Revision Operations 218
8.2.1 Terminologies Related by Revision Operations 218
8.2.2 Making a Primitive Concept Defined 219
8.2.3 Adding an Expression to a Concept Definition 220
8.2.4 Exploiting the Invariants in Reclassification 221
8.3 Supporting Knowledge Acquisition 222

9 Summary and Outlook 225
9.1 Technical Contributions 225
9.2 Open Problems 227

A The Universal Term-Forming Formalism $\mathcal{U}$ 229

B Overview of Formalisms and Systems 231

Bibliography 237

Subject Index 257

Author Index 267

BIBLIOTHEQUE DU CERIST

List of Figures

1.1 Informal Example of a Terminological Knowledge Base 6
1.2 Graphical Depiction of the Example Knowledge Base 7

2.1 Architecture of Knowledge-Based Systems 24

3.1 A Simple Concept Taxonomy 43
3.2 Examples of Role Restrictions and Differentiations 44
3.3 BNF Definition of $\mathcal{TF}$ 48
3.4 A Formal Terminology Using $\mathcal{TF}$ Syntax 50
3.5 BNF Definition of $\mathcal{NTF}$ 55
3.6 BNF Definition of $\mathcal{AF}$ 65
3.7 A Formal World Description Using $\mathcal{AF}$ Syntax 65

4.1 Role-Chain Length Pruning 83
4.2 Unfolding of Assertional Cycles 84
4.3 Splitting of Shared Elements 85
4.4 A Pathological Terminology Leading to an Exponential Explosion 92
4.5 A Worst-Case Terminology for Classification 101
4.6 A Hybrid Inference Ignored by the Realization Algorithm 109

5.1 Circular Definition of Man and Male-human 120
5.2 Recursive Definition of Binary-tree 121
5.3 Some Object Structures Satisfying the Definition of Binary-tree . . 121
5.4 Humans and Parents 122
5.5 Definition of Human and Parent Using Cycles 122
5.6 Object Structures Intended by the Definition of Human 123
5.7 Circular Definition of Car and Car-engine 123
5.8 Object Structures Intended by the Definition of Car and Car-engine 124
5.9 Humans, Horses and Centaurs 132
5.10 General Restriction-Circular Concepts 139
5.11 Syntactic and Semantic Cycles 141

6.1 A Simple Data-Dependency Network 177
6.2 A Cyclic Justification Structure 179
6.3 A Nonmonotonic Data-Dependency Network 181
6.4 Odd and Even Nonmonotonic Loops 182

7.1 A Missing Superconcept Relationship 195
7.2 Two Terminologies Equivalent on the Knowledge Level 201

BIBLIOTHEQUE DU CERIST

List of Tables

8.1 Invariants of Revision Operations 219

B.1 Complexity Results for Various Term-Forming Languages 232
B.2 Features of Hybrid Systems Based on KL-ONE 234
B.3 Features of Hybrid Systems Based on KL-ONE (continued) 235

BIBLIOTHEQUE DU CERIST