LIBRARY AND INFORMATION SCIENCE RESEARCH

Perspectives and Strategies for Improvement

EDITORS
Charles R. McClure
Peter Hernon

Library and Information Science Research: Perspectives and Strategies for Improvement

INFORMATION MANAGEMENT, POLICY, AND SERVICES Charles R. McClure and Peter Hernon, Editors

Library Performance Accountability and Responsiveness: Essays in Honor of Ernest R. DeProspo Charles C. Curran and F. William Summers

Curriculum Initiative: An Agenda and Strategy for Library Media Programs

Michael B. Eisenberg and Robert E. Berkowitz

Resource Companion to Curriculum Initiative: An Agenda and Strategy for Library Media Programs

Michael B. Eisenberg and Robert E. Berkowitz

Information Problem-Solving: The Big Six Skills Approach to Library & Information Skills Instruction

Michael B. Eisenberg and Robert E. Berkowitz

The Role and Importance of Managing Information for Competitive Positioning in Economic Development

Keith Harman

A Practical Guide to Managing Information for Competitive Positioning in Economic Development Keith Harman

Microcomputer Software for Performing Statistical Analysis: A Handbook for Supporting Library Decision Making

Peter Hernon and John V. Richardson (Editors)

Public Access to Government Information, Second Edition

Peter Hernon and Charles R. McClure

Statistics: A Component of the Research Process

Peter Hernon

Statistics for Library Decision Making: A Handbook

Peter Hernon et al.

Libraries: Partners in Adult Literacy

Deborah Johnson, Jane Robbins, and Douglas L. Zweizig

Library and Information Science Research: Perspectives and Strategies for Improvement

Charles R. McClure and Peter Hernon (Editors)

U.S. Government Information Policies: Views and Perspectives

Charles R. McClure, Peter Hernon, and Harold C. Relyea

U.S. Scientific and Technical Information Policies: Views and Perspectives

Charles R. McClure and Peter Hernon

In preparation

Organizational Decision Making and Information Use

Mairead Browne

Technology and Library Information Services

Carol Anderson and Robert Hauptman

Reshaping Librarianship: Advances and Decline in a Female Profession Roma Harris

Microcomputer Local Area Networks and Communications

Thomas R. Kochtanek

Investigations of Human Responses to Knowledge Representations

Mark E. Rorvig

Information Seeking as a Process of Construction

Carol Kulthau

Assessing the Public Library Planning Process

Annabel Stephens

Interpretations of Reference and Bibliographic Work

Howard White, Marcia Bates, and Patrick Wilson

Library and Information Science Research: Perspectives and Strategies for Improvement

Edited by

Charles R. McClure
Syracuse University

Peter HernonSimmons College



Copyright © 1991 by Ablex Publishing Corporation.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording, or otherwise, without permission of the publisher.

Printed in the United States of America

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Library and information science research: perspectives and strategies for improvement / edited by Charles R. McClure, Peter Hernon.

p. cm. — (Information management, policy, and services)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-89391-731-1. — ISBN 0-89391-732-X (pbk.)

1. Library science—Research—Methodology. 2. Information science—Research—Methodology. 1. McClure; Charles R.

II. Hernon, Peter. III. Series.

Z669.7.L476 1991

020'.72-dc20

5902

90-25018 CIP

Ablex Publishing Corporation 355 Chestnut St. Norwood, NJ 07648

Contents

	List of Figures	x
	List of Tables	xii
	Foreword	xiii
	Preface	xvi
	Part I: Overview of Research in Library and Information Science	
1	The Elusive Nature of Research in LIS, by Peter Hernon	3
	Definition of Research Types of Research Types of Research Designs and Methods Quality of Existing Base of Research A Discipline, Profession, or Both? A Paradigm or Unifying Principle Selected Themes Underlying the Book	3 5 6 6 7 9 10
2	Guides to Conducting Research in Library and Information Science, by Ronald R. Powell	15
	Developing the Research Study Basic Research Methodologies and Techniques Applied Research Methodologies Qualitative Research Methodologies Analysis of Data Conclusion	16 18 21 22 23 25
3	Impact of "National Research Agendas" on LIS Research, by Charles Curran	31
	Two Agenda Efforts Other Than the Agendas What Some Other Organizations Do about Topics Conclusion and Recommendations	32 36 37 38
		v

vi Contents

4	The Role of the U.S. Department of Education in Library and Information Science Research, by Anne J. Mathews	45
	Federal Support of Library and Information Science Research Developments, Issues, and Recommendations in the Library and Information	46 53
	Science Research Programs	56
	Appendix A. Funding History of HEA II-B Appendix B. U.S. Department of Education, Office of Educational Research and Improvement Library Programs. Chronological History of Library Research and Demonstration Grants under HEA Title II-B (1977-1989)	57
5	International Aspects of LIS Research, by Michael K. Buckland and John N. Gathegi	63
		64
	Contexts and Comparisons	65
	Difficulties in International Research Comparative Studies	68
	Conclusion and Recommendations	69
_		
6	The Role of Research in the Development of a Profession or a Discipline, by Mary Biggs	72
	Neither a Discipline	72
	Nor a Profession	73
	The Role of Research in the Development of a Discipline	74
	The Role of Research in the Development of a Profession	75
	The Role of Research in the Development of Librarianship	<i>77</i>
	"Technical Rationality" Versus "Reflection-in-Action" New Research Styles for Librarianship	78 79
7	Assessing the Quantity, Quality, and Impact of LIS Research,	
•	by Nancy A. Van House	85
	Social Science Research	86
	Research in the Professions	88
	Research in LIS	89
	Recommendations	94 97
	Conclusion	
8	The Cross-Disciplinary Imperative of LIS Research, by Robert	
	Grover and Roger C. Greer	101
	The New Paradigm	102
	Assessment of Current LIS Research	100
	The Research That Is Needed	109 112
	Conclusion	112
9		
	Standards, by Ellen Altman	114
	Differences in Ideology	115
	The Agencies Funding Research	117
	Accreditation and "Sustained Productive Scholarship"	123
	Recommendations to Improve Research	12:

	Comenia	VIII
10	Library/Information Science Education: The Research Ethos,	
	by Evelyn H. Daniel	128
		140
	Normative Expectations of Universities	129
	Growth and Differentiation of Faculty Growth and Differentiation of Students	130
	Growth and Differentiation of Curriculum	132
	Growth and Differentiation in Organizational Structures	136 137
	Growth and Differentiation of Funding	139
	Conclusion	142
11	The Delegation of the distribution	
11	The Role of LIS Education, by Cheryl Duran	147
	LIS Education	149
	Knowledge Base of Students	150
	Role of LIS Education within the Parent Organization	151
	Critical Areas Meriting Future Research	151
	Research—Who Conducts and Who Funds It	154
	Looking to the Future	155
	Introducing Research into the Curriculum	156
	D. A.H. D. At J.G	
	Part II: Practical Context of Research	
	in Library and Information Science	
12	The Role of the Library Administrator in Improving LIS	
	Research, by Joe A. Hewitt	1.0
	Research, by Joe A. Hewill	163
	Require Reference to the Literature in Library Planning Documents and	
	Committee Reports	166
	Encourage Conscientious Response to Questionnaires and Other Surveys	167
	Insist on High Quality in Surveys Conducted by Library Staff	168
	Be Hospitable to Proposals to Conduct Research in the Library	169
	Treat Major Operational Decisions as Field Experiments	169
	Develop Automated Data Sources and Incorporate Them into Library Decision- Making Processes	
	Assert Commitment to Research as Part of the Library's Mission Statement	170
	Exercise Influence on Library Organizations Conducting Research	171
	Articulate the Research Needs and Concerns of the Practitioner Community	172 173
	Support Ongoing Training in Research Skills	173 174
	Provide Intellectual Leadership in the Library	175
	Conclusion	177
13	The Role of Practicing LIS Professionals, by Irene B. Hoadley	179
	Issues Affecting Research	
	Constraints and Opportunities	180
	Where We Should Go from Here	182 184
	The Next Step	186
14	The Role of Professional Associations, by Julie A.C. Virgo	189
	Some Realities	
	Driving Forces	190

viii Contents

	Roles for Associations	193 195
15	Recommendations The Role of Editors and Editorial Boards in Journal Publishing,	
13	by Dorothy L. Steffens and Jane B. Robbins	197
	Research Production and the Role of Editors	198
	The Role of the Editorial Board	198 199
	Criteria for Selecting Editorial Board Members	199
	The Refereeing Process The Role of Editors and Editorial Board Members in Improving the Quality of	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
	Research in Library and Information Studies	201
	Conclusion	202
16	The Secret Science: The Role of Consulting and LIS Research,	
10	by Douglas L. Zweizig	204
	-	204
	Defining LIS Research Consulting	206
	Contrasts between Research and Consulting	207
	Summary	211
17	The Role of Private Funding Agencies, by Peter R. Young	214
	Statement of the Issues	214
	Importance of Private Agency Funding for LIS Research	219
	Strategies for Private LIS Research Funding Enhancing Research Support	221 224
18	The Role of Networks and Consortia in Library Research,	227
	by Michael Koenig	227
	Research about Networks and Their Role	227
	The Role of Networks in Undertaking and Promoting Research	235 237
	Conclusion	237
19	The Role of the Information Industry, by Candy Schwartz	240
	The Information Industry	240 241
	Current Support for LIS Research	247
	Remaining Problems Conclusion	248
	Part III: Issues and Concerns Related to Research	
	in Library and Information Science	
20	Communicating Applied Library/Information Science Research	
	to Decision Makers: Some Methodological Considerations,	
	by Charles R. McClure	253
	Conflicting Perspectives	254
	Competing Frames of Reference	25
	Strategies and Techniques	260 26
	Making Adjustments	20

	Contents	ix
21	Opportunities and Challenges for LIS Research in Academic Libraries: Elements of Strategy, by Charles T. Townley	267
	Rationale for LIS Research in Academic Libraries	267
	LIS Research Opportunities in Academic Libraries	268
	Research Challenges in Academic Librarianship	269
	Components for Strengthening Academic Library Research	271
	Building Your Strategy	274
	Appendix. ACRL Research Agenda	277
22	Tubic Elotaranship, by sour C. Durance	279
	Context for Needed Research in Public Librarianship	279
	Barriers to the Creation of a Public Library Research Culture	280
	Public Library Leaders and Research	282
	Information Needs Research—A Key to Understanding Societal Needs Advances in Planning and Evaluation of Public Library Services: Toward More	283
	Effective Library Services	285
	Promising Research in Reference Effectiveness	288
	Development of a Research Infrastructure Which Will Foster Public Library	200
	Research Production and Consumption	289
23	Research Needs and Issues in School Librarianship, by Shirley	
	Fitzgibbons and Daniel Callison	207
	ruzgiooons una Daniei Cainson	296
	Background	297
	Current Study	298
	What the Reviews of Research Tell Us	299
	Dissertation Studies Related to School Librarianship (1927–1988) Conclusion and Recommendations	305
		312
24	Research Needs and Issues in Special Librarianship, by James	
	M. Matarazzo	316
	Special Libraries Association	316
	Faculty Involvement with SLA	318
	Task Force on the Value of the Information Professional	320
	Valuing Corporate Libraries	321
	Issues	322
25	Research Needs and Issues in State Librarianship, by Robert E.	
	Dugan and Jane Ouderkirk	224
		326
	Importance of Research	327
	Issues and Constraints Opportunities and Strategies	329
	A Commitment to Research	332
		334
26	Paradigmatic Shift in Library and Information Science,	
	by Martha L. Hale	336
	Key Questions for a Discipline	
	Change and Shift from the Old Paradigm	337 338
	Library Science	339
	Conclusion	343

x Contents

27	Becoming Critical: For a Theory of Purpose and Necessity in American Librarianship, by Michael H. Harris and Masaru Itoga	347
28	Research, Theory, and the Practice of LIS, by Beverly P. Lynch	360
	Research Agendas	360
	Research Questions	362
	Research Methodology	362
	Theory	363
	Concerns	364
	Final Comment	365
	Contributors	367
	Author Index	<i>37</i> :
	Subject Index	382

The state of the s

List of Figures

1-1	Attributes of a Discipline and a Profession	8
1-2	Northwestern University's Criteria for Investing in an	
	Academic Department	11
8-1	Dominant/Emergent Paradigms and Associated Beliefs	104
11-1	Objectives and Topical Areas Covered in a Course on the Role	
	of Research in LIS	157
18-1	Comparison of Developmental Stage Hypotheses for	
	Information Management	230
18-2	Ratios for Information Technology Capabilities	233
19-1	The Information Industries	242
19-2	Information Industry Support for LIS Research	243
19-3	Research Centers Involved in LIS-Related Research	245
20-1	Researchers' and Decision Makers' Frames of Reference	
	(FOR)	259
20-2	Propositions for Improving the Communication of Research to	-07
	Decision Makers	263
24-1	SLA Research Agenda	319

List of Tables

9-1	Research Grants Awarded by the National Library of Medicine	119
9-2	Research Grants Awarded by the National Science Foundation,	
	Division of Information Science and Technology	121
9-3	Publication Records of LIS Faculty in the 10 Years Prior to	
	COA Appointment	124
9-4	Rankings of Journal Prestige by LIS Deans Compared with	
	Publication Records of Faculty on COA	124
10-1	Allocation of Faculty Time	132
10-2	LIS Research Funding	140
17-1	1985 R&D Expenditures by Sector and Character of Work	220
17-2	The Role of Private Funding Agencies	221
23-1	Reviews of Research in School Librarianship	300
23-2	Type of Research Publication Included in Research Reviews	301
23-3	Various Research Methods Used in Dissertations Related to	
	Library Science in General or School Libraries in	
	Specific	306
23-4	Comparison of Research Methods in Ed.D. to Ph.D.	
	Dissertations with Emphasis on School Libraries,	
	1980-1988	307
23-5	Percentage by Types of Doctoral Degrees Granted for	
	Dissertations Related to School Libraries, 1927-1988	307
23-6	Percentage of School Library-Related Doctorates Granted by	
	Institutions Associated with ALA Accredited Master's	
	Degree Programs	309
23-7	Institutions Most Frequently Granting Doctorates Related to	
	School Librarianship, 1927–1988	309
23-8	Level of Library Programs Emphasized in Dissertations	
	Concerning School Libraries, 1927–1988	310

Foreword

Librarians have long enjoyed a love-hate relationship with research. On the one hand, we have a great respect for the life of the mind which leads to and informs research, and many of us manage agencies filled with the results of that activity. On the other hand, we must be pragmatic in our use of scarce resources to satisfy multiple demands, and many of us come to our jobs having had little or no experience with the methodologies appropriate to conducting research on the complex dimensions of the information life-cycle which is the essential subject matter of our field. Thus, we recognize and respect the need for research, but few of us do it and, of those who do, the quality of the result is mixed. Over the years, many have criticized our field for these failings, but few have suggested remedies. The essays in this book fill that gap. All of the authors offer perspectives on the question of how to improve the quantity of research in our field and many suggest specific strategies for doing so. Two problematic aspects of that effort are constant themes in these essays: The possibility and proper role of research in a field dominated by practitioners and the appropriate philosophy or paradigm that should inform research in library and information science (LIS). The essays in this book do not solve those problems. But they do present thoughtful and intelligent arguments that clarify the issues.

This book is closely connected with the Library Research Round Table (LRRT) of the American Library Association. When Nancy Van House became chair-elect of LRRT in June 1989, she decided that her theme for the year would be a consideration of how to improve the quantity and quality of library research. She asked Charles R. McClure to plan a program on that topic for the 1990 Annual Conference and McClure, together with Peter Hernon, decided to do something bigger—to invite a group of nationally known leaders and researchers to produce papers that would offer perspectives and strategies for improving various aspects of the research enterprise in our field. Five of those papers would be selected for presentation at a LRRT program during the 1990 Annual Conference. All of the papers would appear in a published book, and all royalties from the sale of the book would be added to the endowment that supports LRRT's Jesse H. Shera Award for Research.

The first result of those plans was a very successful LRRT program in Chicago at the 1990 ALA Annual Conference. Five of the papers were presented to a large audience and stimulated considerable discussion. This volume completes those plans and presents a multitude of ideas for consideration by everyone concerned about research in library and information science.

xiv Foreword

Part One of this book includes 11 essays providing an "Overview of Research in Library and Information Science." Papers by Peter Hernon, Mary Biggs, and Robert Grover and Roger C. Greer address the nature of the enterprise. Ellen Altman addresses another dimension of that topic, comments on Federal funding for LIS research, and proposes changes in the makeup of ALA's Committee on Accreditation that would help to improve faculty research. Ronald R. Powell presents a very practical guide to the literature on how to conduct research in our field. Charles Curran comments on the impact of several agendas for LIS research that have been proposed recently by different groups, Michael Buckland and John Gathegi discuss international aspects of LIS research, and Nancy Van House assesses its quantity, quality, and impact. Evelyn Daniel and Cheryl Duran present ideas about library education in general and library educators in particular. Anne J. Mathews presents the role of the U.S. Department of Education's Office of Library Programs with a focus on funding provided since 1967 by the Title II.B of the Higher Education Act.

In Part Two, eight experts comment on the role of different agents in improving LIS research. Joe Hewitt suggests 11 practices that library administrators can institute in order to integrate research products and process into the ongoing operation of libraries. Irene Hoadley also makes recommendations regarding the role of practitioners. Julie Virgo analyzes the limited but critical role of professional associations. Dorothy L. Steffins and Jane Robbins describe the role of journal editors and editorial boards. Douglas Zweizig contributes an insightful analysis of the difference between consulting and research with recommendations about how the process and results of consulting could make a greater contribution to research. Michael Koenig describes the role of networks as both subjects for and tools of research. Candy Schwartz describes the role of the information industry in LIS research—a role that is primarily indirect. Peter Young explains why funding from private sources is needed and suggests how to frame LIS questions in ways that might attract such funding.

Part Three begins with an essay by Charles McClure suggesting how library researchers can design and execute applied research projects to ensure that the results will be used by library decision makers. The next five essays focus on research conducted in and about different components of the LIS community. Shirley Fitzgibbons and Daniel Callison assess past research on school librarianship by analyzing several reviews of the research literature and conducting their own analysis of a search of *Dissertation Abstracts International*. They then make recommendations for the future. Charles Townley takes a very different approach for academic librarianship. His comments are addressed to the practitioner and describe both the opportunities offered by research and challenges to getting it done. He then makes general recommendations for improving research in academic librarianship and recommendations for the individual who wants to get involved. Joan Durrance discusses barriers to the creation of a "research culture" in public librarianship and describes several areas where research could play a

major role in helping public libraries be more responsive to societal needs. In his chapter on special librarianship, James Matarazzo focuses on the role of the Special Libraries Association (SLA) in fostering research and on the problem of low involvement in SLA or special librarianship by library school faculty. Robert Dugan and Jane Oederkirk identify potential research roles for state library agencies, explain why research has not been a priority for those agencies, and suggest strategies for change.

The last three essays deal with very broad issues. Marty Hale considers the meaning of the phrase "paradigm shift," describes the recent shift in the paradigm of LIS, and indicates what it means for research in our field. Michael Harris and Masaru Itoga argue that LIS research should be based not on its own paradigm, but on paradigms drawn from the social sciences. They suggest that this strategy "will support librarians in their pursuit of a critical understanding of the structural and functional characteristics of libraries, while at the same time allowing librarians to contribute to the corpus of knowledge about cultural institutions in general." Finally, Beverly Lynch concludes the volume with an essay noting that "the ongoing development of theory and the design of research cannot be divorced from the profession as it is practiced."

Jesse H. Shera would be proud of this book. He believed strongly in the importance of research to the continued vitality of librarianship and would be pleased that 34 experts were willing and able to produce challenging papers filled with strategies for improving research in our field. It is very appropriate that royalties from the sale of this volume will be added to the endowment fund established several years ago when LRRT renamed its 12-year-old research award in honor of Jesse H. Shera. The award is given annually to an excellent paper presenting the results of library research. By giving that award each year, LRRT has recognized and encouraged excellent research. In sponsoring this book, LRRT makes a different and perhaps larger contribution toward its objectives. The many actionable ideas presented here are a challenge to LRRT itself and to the many other groups and individuals in the library and information science community who share Shera's belief in the importance of research.

Mary Jo Lynch
Director
Office for Research
American Library Association
50 E. Huron St.
Chicago, IL 60611

Preface

The role and importance of research in librarianship, and later in library and information science, have been controversial. Some maintain that research is important to professional practice and the theoretical base of the profession/discipline, while others disagree. As library and information science matures as a profession and a discipline, there is increased interest in how that role can be strengthened, how the profession/discipline can enhance its research base, and how practicing librarians and other information professionals, might become more aware of the role and importance of research.

The research basis of any profession and discipline merits regular and careful scrutiny and review. That assessment should stimulate thinking about the role of research and the opportunities for the conduct of research. Such an assessment also provides ideas, approaches, and strategies that can assist the advancement of the profession or discipline and improve the overall quality, quantity, and impact of that research.

Any in-depth discussion of research in library and information science should involve individuals from various backgrounds and work-related situations. Such discussions illustrate that research is not the province of any one group and that research plays an important role in the larger context of scientific inquiry.

The 28 chapters in this book provide a forum for individuals from different backgrounds to present their unique perspectives. The chapters offer an overview and perspective on research in library and information science; identify key issues, constraints, and opportunities affecting research; suggest areas of agreement and disagreement among contributors; and offer specific strategies to improve research in library and information science.

As editors, our original intent was for each chapter to comprise a position paper of approximately 15 manuscript pages. However, as is evident, most contributors could not limit their assessment to our page expectations. Nonetheless, the contributors admirably accomplish the four objectives of the monograph:

- Provide a state-of-the-art assessment, discussion, and overview of research in library and information science;
- Offer specific recommendations and strategies for resolving issues related to research in library and information science and for improving the quality, quantity, and impact of that research;

xviii Preface

- Increase the profession's (and library school students') awareness of the role and importance of research in library and information science; and
- Identify and analyze key issues and topics from a broad perspective cutting across a number of groups within library and information science.

The book should appeal to anyone interested in library and information science research and the conditions as well as strategies for improving that research. In particular, the monograph should appeal to members of professional library and information-related associations, individuals associated with private and public funding organizations, library school educators and students, and others interested in issues related to library and information science and its cross-disciplinary base.

Charles R. McClure Peter Hernon July 1990