

Imperial College of Science, Technology and Medicine
University of London
Department of Computing

Domain-Based Security for Distributed Object Systems

Nikolaos Yialelis

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of
Philosophy in the Faculty of Engineering of the University of London, and for the
Diploma of Imperial College of Science, Technology and Medicine.

August 1996

Corrected October 1996

Abstract

Advances in telecommunications technology have resulted in the proliferation of large distributed systems in commercial environments. Distributed systems, however, are vulnerable to unauthorised access to resources and compromise of information, either in terms of integrity or confidentiality. Furthermore, a distributed system may contain a large number of objects that are mutually suspicious making it hard to specify security policy. In addition, such a system may cross organisational boundaries necessitating decentralised security management.

This thesis proposes a security architecture for distributed object systems that supports access control services based on the concept of a *domain*. Domains can be used to group objects in a hierarchical structure, to apply a common security policy, to reflect organisational or geographical structure, or to partition the security management in order to cope with the complexity of large distributed systems.

An access control policy specifies, in terms of domains, what operations a set of subjects is permitted to perform on a set of targets. In a distributed system, however, a client often delegates access rights to a proxy server to perform operations on behalf of the client. As delegation of access rights should be controlled, the notion of the access control policy has been extended to deal with cascaded delegation.

The security architecture provides a high degree of access control and authentication transparency to the application level by utilising security agents on each host. A policy dissemination mechanism has been developed to propagate policies through hierarchical domain structures to the agents of the concerned objects and deal with changes in the domain structure.

The access control mechanism, which is based on the Access Control List (ACL) paradigm, enforces access control policies specified in terms of domains and deals with cascaded delegation of access rights.

As the access control decisions are based on domain membership, there is a need to efficiently authenticate domain membership as well as object and user identity. The proposed intra-realm authentication system is based on symmetric cryptography to minimise the encryption/decryption overhead. Verification of domain membership is based on statements issued by the domain service and translated by the authentication system into the keys of the verifiers. Similarly, verification of delegation is based on delegation tokens issued by the grantors and translated into the keys of the end-points.

*ΣΤΟΥΣ ΓΟΝΕΙΣ ΜΟΥ
ΓΕΩΡΓΙΟ ΚΑΙ ΚΩΝΣΤΑΝΤΙΝΑ
(To my parents George and Constantina)*

Acknowledgements

I am indebted to my supervisor Professor Morris Sloman. This work would not have been carried out without his guidance, suggestions and constructive criticism. My thanks are also due to Dr Jonathan Moffett, Dr Kevin Twidle, Damian A. Marriott and Emil Lupu who took time to read reports describing earlier stages of this work and provided useful feedback.

I also wish to acknowledge the help given me by many research students, research assistants and others members of the Distributed Software Engineering Section. Thank you Paris Bayias, S.C. Cheung, Paul Dias, Douglas Donaldson, Naranker Dulay, Hal Fossa, Dimitra Giannakopoulou, Celso Hirata, Christos Karamanolis, Masoud Mansouri-Samani, Nabor das Chagas Mendonca, Kaveh Moazami-Goudarzi, Keng Ng, Wai Leung Poon, Thanwadee Thanitsukkarn and Andrea Zisman.

My thanks are also due to Tracy Banton, Aspasia Daskalopoulou, Kostis Dryllerakis, Monica Leutner, Fotini G. Markopoulou-Kalamara, Stavros Menegos, Anne O'Neill, Yongyuth Permpoontanalarp and Nikos Scarmeas, who all have contributed considerable help during my studies at Imperial College.

I gratefully acknowledge financial support from the British Council, Swiss Bank Corporation (London), Esprit SysMan (7026) Project and Imperial College.

Table of Contents

Table of Contents	vii
List of Figures	xiii
List of Tables	xvii
List of Abbreviations	xix

Chapter 1

Introduction	21
1.1 Motivation and Aims.....	21
1.2 Our Approach.....	24
1.3 What is New in this Thesis.....	25
1.4 Thesis Outline.....	26

Chapter 2

Background	29
2.1 Security in Distributed Systems	29
2.1.1 Information Security	30
2.1.2 Threats in a Distributed System.....	30
2.1.3 Security Functionality.....	31
2.2 Access Control Policy	32
2.2.1 Security Policy.....	32
2.2.2 Access Control Policy	33
2.2.3 Traditional Access Control Policies	34
2.3 Access Control Enforcement.....	35
2.3.1 Reference Monitor.....	35

2.3.2 Access Control Lists and Capabilities.....	36
2.3.3 An Access Control Calculus.....	38
2.4 Basic Cryptographic Tools	41
2.4.1 An Example	41
2.4.2 Symmetric Cryptography.....	42
2.4.3 Symmetric Cryptosystems.....	43
2.4.4 Asymmetric Cryptography	45
2.4.5 Asymmetric Cryptosystems	46
2.4.6 Hash Functions	47
2.4.7 Message Authentication Code (MAC).....	47
2.4.8 Ensuring Message Secrecy and Integrity	48
2.4.9 Cryptanalysis.....	49
2.5 Authentication.....	51
2.5.1 Basic Aspects	51
2.5.2 Authentication Based on Symmetric Cryptography	53
2.5.3 Authentication Based on Asymmetric Cryptography.....	54
2.5.4 Relays.....	55
2.5.5 Multiple Authentication Servers and CAs.....	56
2.5.6 Other Authentication Issues	57
2.6 Chapter Summary	57

Chapter 3

Domain-Based Access Control.....	59
3.1 The Domain Concept.....	59
3.1.1 Objects	60
3.1.2 Domains	60
3.1.3 Domain Service	62
3.2 Domain-Based Policies	62
3.2.1 The Principle	63
3.2.2 Domain Scope Expressions	64
3.2.3 Access Rules	66
3.2.4 Policies Applying to Users	69
3.2.5 Policy Service.....	70
3.2.6 Authorisation Policies for Security Administrators.....	70
3.2.7 Roles	71
3.3 Chapter Summary	72

Chapter 4

Delegation of Access Rights	73
4.1 Introduction	73
4.1.1 The Problem	74
4.1.2 Some Definitions	75
4.1.3 Cascaded Delegation	76
4.1.4 Discussion.....	76
4.2 Related Work	77
4.2.1 General	78
4.2.2 Delegation in Taos.....	79
4.3 Extended Access Rules	84
4.3.1 Controlling Delegation in Distributed Systems	84
4.3.2 Extended Access Rules	84
4.3.3 An Example	87
4.4 Chapter Summary	89

Chapter 5

Overview of the Security Architecture	91
5.1 Introduction	91
5.2 Access Control.....	93
5.3 Authentication System	95
5.3.1 Registration of Principals.....	95
5.3.2 Verification of Domain Membership	96
5.3.3 Delegation	96
5.3.4 User Authentication	97
5.4 Secure Channels.....	98
5.4.1 A Typical Scenario	98
5.5 Related Work	101
5.7 Chapter Summary	103

Chapter 6

Access Control	105
6.1 Introduction	105
6.2 Policy Distribution.....	106
6.2.1 Dynamic Policy Scopes.....	106
6.2.2 Propagation of Policy Scope Evaluation Tokens (PETs)	107
6.2.3 Dynamic Domain Structures.....	110
6.2.4 Monitoring the Propagation Process	111
6.2.5 Policy Hand Over.....	112
6.3 Propagation of Pseudo-Capabilities	113
6.3.1 Determination of the Pseudo-Capability Certificate Sets.....	114
6.3.2 Special Cases.....	116
6.4 Secure Channel Access Control Information.....	116
6.4.1 Access Control Information Held by the ACAs.....	116
6.4.2 Determining the Privileges of the Subject.....	118
6.4.3 One-Hop Delegation.....	121
6.4.4 Cascaded Delegation	122
6.5 Restricted Access Rights.....	124
6.5.1 An Example	124
6.5.2 Pseudo-Capability Select Expressions	126
6.5.3 Restriction of Rights by a Grantee.....	128
6.6 Access Control API	128
6.6.1 The Interface	128
6.6.2 An Example	130
6.7 Chapter Summary	133

Chapter 7

Authentication System	135
7.1 Introduction	135
7.2 Asymmetric vs. Symmetric Cryptography	136
7.2.1 Asymmetric cryptography	136
7.2.2 Symmetric cryptography.....	138
7.3 Authentication Servers with Minimal State	138
7.3.1 Private-Key Certificates.....	138

7.3.2 Basic Aspects and Notation	139
7.3.3 Establishing Shared Keys Between Authentication Agents	140
7.3.4 Translation of Messages	142
7.3.5 Certificate Revocation.....	144
7.4. Secure Channels.....	146
7.4.1 Communication Security	146
7.4.2 Channel Keys.....	147
7.4.3 Setting up a Secure Channel	148
7.4.4 Cryptographic Facilities	149
7.5. Verification of Domain Membership	150
7.5.1 An Example	151
7.5.2 Domain Membership and Secure Channels	153
7.6 Delegation of Access Rights	153
7.6.1 Delegation Protocols	154
7.6.2 Revocation of Delegation Tokens	158
7.6.3 Restricted Access Rights	158
7.6.4 Discussion and Related Work.....	159
7.7 Chapter Summary	161

Chapter 8

Conclusions	163
8.1 Review of Aims and Accomplishments.....	163
8.1.1 Delegation of Access Rights	164
8.1.2 Policy Distribution	165
8.1.3 Access Control Enforcement.....	165
8.1.4 Authentication.....	166
8.1.5 Security Architecture.....	167
8.2 Performance Issues	167
8.2.1 Usage Assumptions.....	167
8.2.2 Numerical Estimates	168
8.2.3 Pull vs. Push.....	173
8.3 Further Work	174
8.4 Final Remarks	175

Appendix

Evaluation of Policy Scopes.....	177
A.1 Propagation Control Flags (PCFs).....	177
A.1.1 Controlling the Propagation Depth.....	178
A.2 Policy Scope Evaluation Tokens (PETs).....	179
A.2.1 Skeleton Parser.....	181
A.2.2 An Example.....	182
A.3 Dynamic Domain Structure	184
A.3.1 Insertion of a Non-Domain Object	185
A.3.2 Removal of a Non-Domain Object	185
A.3.3 Insertion of a Subdomain	186
A.3.4 Removal of a Subdomain	187
A.4 Policy Retraction	187
A.5 Propagation in the Subject and Grantee Scopes	187
Bibliography.....	191

List of Figures

Figure 1.1 Main Issues Discussed in This Thesis	24
Figure 2.1 Security Functionality and Dependencies.....	32
Figure 2.2 ISO Reference Monitor	35
Figure 2.3 Example for Multiple Reference Monitors.....	36
Figure 2.4(a) Use of Access Control Lists	37
Figure 2.4(b) Use of Capabilities.....	37
Figure 2.5 An Example for Cryptographically Protected Communication.....	42
Figure 2.6 Use of a Message Authentication Code (MAC).....	48
Figure 2.7 Encryption of a Message Along With its Digest	49
Figure 2.8 Kerberos V4 Authentication Protocol (simplified).....	53
Figure 3.1 Object Identifier.....	60
Figure 3.2 Two Graphical Representations of a Domain Structure.....	61
Figure 3.3 Domain Service Provided by Multiple Domain Servers.....	63
Figure 3.4 A Domain Structure	65
Figure 3.5 Policy Refinement and Enforcement	67
Figure 3.6 Graphical Representation of an Access Rule	68
Figure 3.7 Adapter Object Acting on behalf of a User	69
Figure 3.8 Administrator Interacting with the Policy Service	70
Figure 3.9 Authorisation Policy for a Security Administrator (SA)	71
Figure 4.1 A Tree of Cascaded Invocations	74
Figure 4.2 A Cascaded Invocation Scenario.....	75
Figure 4.3 Cascaded Delegation	76
Figure 4.4 Sketch of the Delegation Issue.....	77
Figure 4.5 One-hop Delegation	80
Figure 4.6 Two-Hop Delegation.....	82
Figure 4.7 Graphical Representation of an Extended Access Rule	85
Figure 4.8 Cascaded Delegation Permitted by an Extended Access Rule	86
Figure 4.9 Partial View of an Hypothetical Domain Structure	88
Figure 4.10 Cascaded Delegation Controlled by the Rules in Table 4.1	89
Figure 5.1 Sketch of the Security Architecture.....	93

Figure 5.2	Dissemination of Access Rules (simplified)	94
Figure 5.3	A Possible Membership Path.....	97
Figure 5.4	Subject Host and Secure Channel Establishment	99
Figure 5.5	Target Host and Secure Channel Establishment.....	100
Figure 6.1	Three States of a Domain Structure.....	107
Figure 6.2	Two-phase Policy Dissemination	108
Figure 6.3	An Example of PCF Propagation	109
Figure 6.4(a)	Example for PET Propagation When Insertion of a Subdomain Takes Place	110
Figure 6.4(b)	Example for PET Propagation When Removal of a Subdomain Takes Place	110
Figure 6.5	Propagation of Acknowledgements.....	111
Figure 6.6	Reporting a Propagation Failure	113
Figure 6.7	Policy Hand Over and Retraction	114
Figure 6.8	Propagation in the Subject Scope and Determination of the Capability Certificate Set (CCS)	115
Figure 6.9	Access Control Information Held by an ACA.....	117
Figure 6.10	Construction of the Candidate Channel Policy List	118
Figure 6.11	Construction of the RCPL.....	119
Figure 6.12	Construction of the CCPL for One-Hop Delegation	120
Figure 6.13	Construction of the RCPL When Delegation Takes Place.....	122
Figure 6.14	Cascaded Delegation	123
Figure 6.15	Example for Restriction of Access Rights.....	125
Figure 6.16	Example for Pseudo-Capability Select Expressions	127
Figure 6.17	Cascaded Delegation Controlled by the Rules in Table 4.1	132
Figure 7.1	Using Private Key Certificates to Disperse the Security Database	139
Figure 7.2	Shared secret key establishment between authentication agents.....	141
Figure 7.3	Message Translation by the Authentication Service.....	143
Figure 7.4	Translation of a CRL	144
Figure 7.5	Authentication Agents Setting Up a Secure Channel	148
Figure 7.6	Invocation on a Channel Providing Authenticity and Secrecy.....	150
Figure 7.7	Example of Domain Membership Verification.....	152
Figure 7.8	One Step Delegation Protocol	155
Figure 7.9	Two Step Delegation Protocol.....	156
Figure 7.10	Misuse of Delegation Token if the PDT Field is Omitted.....	157
Figure 7.11	Attack on the Delegation Protocol Using Repeated DIDs.....	157
Figure 7.12	Revocation of a Delegation Token.....	158
Figure A.1	Propagation of a PCF.....	179
Figure A.2	Propagation of Two PCFs Generated by *DomA - *DomB	180

Figure A.3 Propagation of PETs by *DomA - (*2DomB ^ @DomC).....	183
Figure A.4 Propagation of PCFs by *DomA - (*2DomB ^ @DomC).....	184
Figure A.5(a) Example for Insertion of a Subdomain.....	186
Figure A.5(b) Example for Removal of a Subdomain.....	186
Figure A.6 Propagation of PCFs in Negative PETs for Policy Retraction.....	188
Figure A.7(a) Propagation of PCFs in the Subject Scope of *A.....	189
Figure A.7(b) Removal of a PCF.....	189

List of Tables

Table 2.1	DES Modes of Operation.....	44
Table 4.1	A Set of Extended Access Rules	88
Table 5.1	Distribution of Information Related to a Secure Channel.....	100
Table 8.1	Estimated Invocation Latency on Secure Channels	169
Table 8.2	Numerical Estimates using Symmetric and Asymmetric Cryptosystems.....	171
Table 8.3	Delegation-related Estimates using Symmetric and Asymmetric Cryptosystems.....	172
Table A.1	Skeleton Parser States.....	185

List of Abbreviations

AA	Authentication Agent	GCCS	Grantee Capability Certificate Set
ACA	Access Control Agent	GPCL	Grantee Pseudo-Capability List
ACPL	Access Control Policy List	MAC	Message Authentication Code
AR	Access Rule	OID	Object Identifier
AS	Authentication Service	OMG	Object Management Group
CA	Certification Authority	ORB	Object Request Broker
CCPL	Candidate Channel Policy List	PCF	Propagation Control Flag
CCS	Capability Certificate Set	PCL	Pseudo-Capability List
CF	Cryptographic Facility	PDT	Preceding Delegation Token
CHID	Secure Channel Identifier	PET	Policy scope Evaluation Token
CID	Certificate Identifier	PFS	Perfect Forward Security
CRL	Certificate Revocation List	PKC	Private-Key Certificate
DAR	Delegated Access Rights	PSCE	Pseudo-Capability Select Expression
DID	Delegation token Identifier	RCPL	Resolved Channel Policy List
DMCL	Delegation Membership Certificate Set	RMF	Reference Monitor Facility
DPCL	Delegation Pseudo-Capability List	RPD	Role Position Domain
DRL	Delegation token Revocation List	SMCL	Subject Membership Certificate List
DSE	Domain Scope Expression	SN	Serial Number
DSSA	Distributed Systems Security Architecture	TCB	Trusted Computing Base
DT	Delegation Token	UID	Unique Identifier
		URD	User Representation Domain